



May 28, 2013

Mayor Joseph DeStefano
City of Middletown
16 James Street
Middletown, New York 10940

Re: Competitive Power Ventures (CPV) Valley Energy Project – Application for Zoning Variances

Dear Mayor DeStefano:

Hudson River Sloop Clearwater, Inc. (Clearwater) submits the following comments on the proposed CPV Valley Energy Center project and CPV's request for consideration under a "Relaxed Zoning Standards" application, as well as a use variance regarding the construction and operation of an interconnection substation and ancillary facilities referenced collectively in their ZBA application as the "GIS Building", and an area zoning variance concerning an eight-foot high fence with barbed wire.

As you may be aware, a major component of Clearwater's mission is *to preserve and protect the Hudson River, its tributaries and related bodies of water*. Clearwater has spent the past year actively participating in the Mid-Hudson Regional Sustainability Plan, focusing on the Energy Working Group. Through this process and our Green Cities Initiative, we have been actively promoting the transition to a Green Energy Economy, which combines energy efficiency and a balanced portfolio of renewable energy generation, to reduce our carbon footprint and create sustainable jobs. In view of this, there is much that concerns us about CPV's proposed project(s), not the least of which is the discharge of grey water from the City of Middletown's sewer plant that will be used for cooling purposes at the CPV plant, into the Wallkill River – an already compromised water body.

We concur with Riverkeeper, Inc. that the CPV Valley Energy Center project and the ancillary facilities associated with it are not necessary to implement a clean energy portfolio for New York State. Nor is natural gas-powered energy necessary to replace energy currently provided by Indian Point to the Lower Hudson Valley, as is amply documented by the Synapse Energy Economics Report.

These assertions are strengthened further by research reported in the journal *Science Today*. The "Solutions Project" co-authored by Dr. Mark Z. Jacobson of Stanford University, Dr. Anthony R. Ingraffea, professor of engineering and Weiss Presidential Teaching Fellow at Cornell University and Dr. Jannette M. Barth, economist and research consultant with the Pepacton Institute along with other distinguished scholars conclude that it is technically and economically feasible to convert New York's energy infrastructure to one powered by wind, water and sunlight at significant savings in human lives and infrastructure as well as decreased greenhouse gas emissions, pollution and damages caused by the resultant climate change and extreme weather. Given this, CPV's claim to "clean energy" production is unsubstantiated.

CPV's reliance on hydrofracked natural gas delivered to the proposed power plant by means of the Millennium Pipeline and the Minisink Compressor Station, which both pose additional health and safety risks as well as property devaluation and harm the environment, will increase and prolong our dependence on fossil fuels, which will ultimately result in great human, environmental and economic costs. Likewise, the diesel fuel used for intermittent plant operations will also add to pollution, augmenting adverse environmental and socio-economic impacts, as well as health hazards that jeopardize the security and welfare of the community.

In view of the foregoing, Clearwater views CPV's Valley Energy Center project and its related components as *significant* and strongly recommends against their request for Reduced Zoning Standards application to their "Project" and urges denial of their requests for a use and area variance.

Sincerely,



Manna Jo Greene, Environmental Action Director

cc: Kate Hudson, Riverkeeper, Inc. Watershed Program Director
Thomas Amodio, Middletown ZBA Acting Chair
Pramilla Malick, STOPMCS
Randolph Hurst, Protect Orange County